

DOUGLAS A. DUCEY  
- GOVERNOR -



VICTORIA WHITMORE  
- EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR -

## ARIZONA STATE VETERINARY MEDICAL EXAMINING BOARD

1740 W. ADAMS ST., STE. 4600 ♡ PHOENIX, ARIZONA 85007

PHONE: (602) 364-1-PET ♡ FAX: (602) 364-1039

VETBOARD.AZ.GOV

### MINUTES

January 16, 2019

Board Room A, at 8:30 a.m.

1740 W. Adams Street, Board Room A

Phoenix, Arizona 85007

**Members Present:** Dr. Sarah Heinrich, Dr. J. Greg Byrne, Ms. Jessica Creager, Ms. Nikki Frost, CVT, Dr. Darren Wright, Dr. Christina Bertch, Dr. Robyn Jaynes, and Ms. Jane Soloman.

**Members Absent:** Mr. Jim Loughead.

**Staff and Legal Counsel Present:** Ms. Victoria Whitmore, Executive Director; Ms. Sunita Krishna, Assistant Attorney General (AAG), Mr. Michael Raine, Assistant Attorney General (AAG); and Ms. Tracy Riendeau, CVT, Senior Medical Investigator.

## I. CALL TO ORDER

**Roll call:** Ms. Victoria Whitmore at 8:30 a.m.

## II. INITIAL INVESTIGATIVE REVIEW

### 1. 19-17, Re: Christine Sullivan, DVM

After discussion and consideration, a motion was made by Dr. Bertch and seconded by Dr. Heinrich to accept the Investigative Committee's recommendation and **dismiss** this issue with no violation. Motion passed unanimously.

### 2. 19-18, Re: Roxanna Cornelius, DVM

After discussion and consideration, a motion was made by Dr. Heinrich and seconded by Dr. Bertch to accept the Investigative Committee's recommendation and **dismiss** this issue with no violation. Motion passed unanimously.

### 3. 19-19, Re: Kara Thomas, DVM

Dr. Jaynes was recused. Dr. Thomas was present with Attorney David Stoll and made statements. Attorney Barbara McCloud was present to monitor. Maria, Stan and Alicia Falcon were present and made statements. After discussion and consideration, a motion was made by Dr. Heinrich and seconded by Dr. Bertch to **disagree** with the Investigative Committee's recommendation and **dismiss** this issue with no violation. Motion passed 6 ayes, 1 recusal and 1 nay (Ms. Frost).

**4. 19-20, Re: Patricia Bennett, DVM**

Dr. Jaynes was recused. Dr. Bennett was present with Attorney David Stoll and made statements. Attorney Barbara McCloud was present to monitor. Maria, Stan and Alicia Falcon were present and made statements. After discussion and consideration, a motion was made by Dr. Heinrich and seconded by Ms. Creager to **disagree** with the Investigative Committee's recommendation and **dismiss** this issue with no violation. Motion passed with 7 ayes and 1 recusal.

**5. 19-21, Re: Jason Eberhardt, DVM**

Dr. Jaynes was recused. Attorneys David Stoll and Barbara McCloud were present to monitor. Maria, Stan, and Alicia Falcon were present and made statements. After discussion and consideration, a motion was made by Dr. Heinrich and seconded by Dr. Bertch to accept the Investigative Committee's recommendation and **dismiss** this issue with no violation. Motion passed 7 ayes, 1 recusal.

**6. 19-22, Re: Jason Evans, DVM**

Dr. Jaynes was recused. Attorneys David Stoll and Barbara McCloud were present to monitor. Maria, Stan, and Alicia Falcon were present and made statements. After discussion and consideration, a motion was made by Dr. Heinrich and seconded by Ms. Creager to accept the Investigative Committee's recommendation and **dismiss** this issue with no violation. Motion passed 7 ayes, 1 recusal.

**7. 19-23, Re: Carla Gartrell, DVM**

Dr. Jaynes was recused. Attorney Barbara McCloud was present to monitor. Maria, Stan, and Alicia Falcon were present and made statements. After discussion and consideration, a motion was made by Dr. Heinrich and seconded by Ms. Creager to accept the Investigative Committee's recommendation and **dismiss** this issue with no violation. Motion passed 7 ayes, 1 recusal.

**8. 19-24, Re: Martin Crabo, DVM**

Attorney David Stoll was present to monitor. After discussion and consideration, a motion was made by Dr. Byrne and seconded by Dr. Bertch to accept the Investigative Committee's recommendation and **dismiss** this issue with no violation. Motion passed unanimously.

**9. 19-25, Re: Christopher Zetye, DVM**

Mr. Scott Sloan was present and made statements. After discussion and consideration, a motion was by Dr. Bertch and seconded by Dr. Heinrich to accept the Investigative Committee's recommendation and **dismiss** this issue with no violation. Motion passed unanimously.

**10. 19-26 Re: Cynthia Barnes, DVM**

Dr. Bertch and Ms. Frost were recused. After discussion and consideration, a motion was made by Ms. Creager and seconded by Dr. Heinrich to accept the Investigative Committee's recommendation and **dismiss** this issue with no violation. Motion passed 6 ayes, 2 recusals.

### **11. 19-27, Re: Sarah Kassing, DVM**

Dr. Bertch and Ms. Frost were recused. After discussion and consideration, a motion was made by Ms. Creager and seconded by Dr. Heinrich to accept the Investigative Committee's recommendation and **dismiss** this issue with no violation. Motion passed 6 ayes, 2 recusals.

### **12. 19-29, Re: Julie Yeager, DVM**

Dr. Yeager was present with attorney David Stoll and made statements. After discussion and consideration, a motion was made by Dr. Jaynes and seconded by Ms. Soloman to schedule this matter for an **Informal Interview**. Motion passed 6 ayes, 2 nays (Ms. Creager and Dr. Heinrich).

### **13. 19-30, In Re: Elizabeth Dutton, DVM**

Attorney David Stoll was present to monitor. After discussion and consideration, a motion was made by Ms. Frost and seconded by Dr. Bertch to accept the Investigative Committee's recommendation and **dismiss** this issue with no violation. Motion passed 6 ayes, 2 nays (Ms. Soloman and Dr. Wright).

## **II. INFORMAL INTERVIEWS AND BOARD DELIBERATION**

### **1. 19-11, In Re: Alisa Reniker, DVM**

Dr. Reniker was present with attorney David Stoll and made statements and answered questions. Ms. Deborah Scarpelli was present, made statements and answered questions. After discussion and consideration, a motion was made by Dr. Bertch and seconded by Dr. Heinrich to **dismiss** this issue with no violation. Motion passed unanimously.

## **IV. ADMINISTRATIVE REVIEW OF PREVIOUS ACTIONS**

### **1.19-37, In Re: Crystal Delano, DVM. Board may review, discuss, and take action on compliance with interim Consent Agreement and possible summary suspension of veterinary license and may offer a Consent Agreement.**

Dr. Delano was present, made statements and answered questions. After discussion and consideration, a motion was made by Dr. Bertch and seconded by Dr. Heinrich to offer Dr. Delano a **Consent Agreement** with the terms and conditions set forth in the addictionologist's report. The Consent Agreement will also include a Stayed Suspension Probation of 5 years. The Consent Agreement will be drafted and brought back to the Board next month for approval and to adopt the Findings of Fact and Conclusions of Law; Dr. Delano will remain suspended under her current Consent Agreement until that time. Motion passed 7 ayes, 1 nay (Ms. Soloman).

### **2.18-47, In Re: Adrianna Stinnett, DVM. Board may review, discuss, and take action on Continuing Education plan submitted in compliance with Board Order.**

After discussion and consideration, a motion was made by Dr. Heinrich and seconded by Dr. Bertch to **approve** Dr. Stinnett's continuing education plan submitted in compliance with her Board Order. Motion passed unanimously.

**3.18-83, In Re: Virginia Kern, DVM. Board may review, discuss, and take action on Continuing Education plan submitted in compliance with Board Order.**

After discussion and consideration, a motion was made by Dr. Heinrich and seconded by Dr. Bertch to **approve** the partial continuing education plan for medical record keeping submitted in compliance with her Board Order. Motion passed unanimously.

**V. REPORTS, CORRESPONDENCE, REFERRALS AND OTHER BUSINESS**

**1. Board may review, discuss, and take action to interview Investigative Committee member applicants.**

**a. Nellie Goetz, DVM**

Dr. Goetz appeared, made statements and answered questions.

**b. Jarrod Butler, DVM**

Dr. Butler appeared, made statements and answered questions.

After discussion and consideration, a motion was made by Ms. Creager and seconded by Ms. Soloman to appoint Dr. Butler to the Investigative Committee. Motion passed 5 ayes, 3 nays (Dr. Bertch, Dr. Byrne and Dr. Heinrich).

**2. Board may review, discuss, and take action on technician certification pending receipt of certificate fee.**

- a. Brooke Burchfield**
- b. Lianne Chung**
- c. Marie Dillon**
- d. Jocelyn Dunn**
- e. Umi Kamewada**
- f. Ruth Pugliese**
- g. Brianna Rittschof**
- h. Gracyn Shorette**
- i. Jessica Wheeler**
- j. Taylor Yoder**

After discussion and consideration, a motion was made by Dr. Bertch and seconded by Ms. Creager to approve the above technician certifications pending receipt of certificate fee. Motion passed unanimously.

**3. Board may review, discuss, and take action on request for approval of continuing education.**

**a. Pitcairn Institute of Veterinary Homeopathy – 2019 Annual Meeting**

After discussion and consideration, a motion was made by Dr. Heinrich and seconded by Dr. Jaynes to approve 16 hours of Pitcairn Institute of Veterinary Homeopathy – 2019 Annual Meeting; excluding courses "Strange, Rare and Peculiar" and "Keratitis in a Horse." Motion passed unanimously.

**4. Board may review, discuss, and take action on denial of veterinary license – George Stroberg**

After discussion and consideration, a motion was made by Ms. Creager and seconded by Dr. Bertch to deny licensure to applicants that failed the exam and appoint Ms. Whitmore

to represent the Board if a settlement conference is requested with her authority limited to denial of licensure. Motion passed unanimously.

**5. Board may review, discuss, and take action on special accommodations request in taking the veterinary State exam, from Keith N. Blackmore, DVM, MRCVS.**

- At 9:56am, a motion was made by Dr. Wright and seconded by Ms. Soloman to go into executive session for legal advice. Motion passed unanimously.
- At 10:01am, the Board entered back into open session.

After discussion and consideration, the Board directed staff to request Dr. Blackmore to attend a future Board meeting to discuss options of reasonable accommodations.

**6. Board may review, discuss, and take action on veterinary renewal applications received from:**

**a. Glen Grady, DVM**

After discussion and consideration, a motion was made by Dr. Heinrich and seconded by Ms. Creager to approve Dr. Grady's renewal application. Motion passed unanimously.

**b. Hannah Bigelow, DVM**

After discussion and consideration, a motion was made by Dr. Heinrich and seconded by Ms. Creager to approve Dr. Bigelow's renewal application. Motion passed unanimously.

**c. Pamela Jones, DVM**

After discussion and consideration, a motion was made by Dr. Heinrich and seconded by Ms. Frost to approve Dr. Jones's renewal application. The Board also directed staff to remind Dr. Jones of the law that requires licensed healthcare professionals to report certain charges within 10 days. Motion passed unanimously.

**d. Ayman S. Ibrahim, DVM**

After discussion and consideration, a motion was made by Dr. Heinrich and seconded by Ms. Creager to approve Dr. Ibrahim's renewal application. Motion passed unanimously.

**e. Roxanne Benally, DVM**

After discussion and consideration, a motion was made by Ms. Soloman and seconded by Dr. Jaynes to approve Dr. Benally's renewal application. Motion passed unanimously.

**7. Board may review, discuss, and take action on American Association of Veterinary State Boards' Call for Nominations.**

No action taken.

**8. Board may review, discuss, and take action on denial of technician certification.**

- a. Kaylee Grammer**
- b. Kayla Reynolds**
- c. Emily Mennenga**
- d. Victoria Spofford**

- e. Ealing, Kathryn
- f. Fastenau, Maegan
- g. Fenton, Jennifer
- h. Guitierrez, Marisa
- i. Hodges, Danielle
- j. Llamas Silva, Guadalupe
- k. Mavis, Rebecca
- l. Mavis, Sarah

After discussion and consideration, a motion was made by Ms. Creager and seconded by Ms. Soloman to deny certification of applicants that failed the VTNE and/or state exam and appoint Ms. Whitmore to represent the Board if a settlement conference is requested with her authority limited to denial of certification. Motion passed unanimously.

**9. Board may review, discuss, and take action on approval of technician certification pending receipt of certificate fee.**

- a. Guadalupe Blancarte
- b. Brooke Burchfield
- c. Lianne Chung
- d. Marie Dillon
- e. Laura Dancer
- f. Jocelyn Dunn
- g. Christina Finnie
- h. Karen Galvan-Alvarez
- i. Umi Kamewada
- j. Kristin Kemp
- k. Julie Magby
- l. Stefanie Marcotte
- m. Shelby Montague
- n. Elizabeth Munoz
- o. Ruth Pugliese
- p. Shannon Racadio
- q. Jessica Reppenhagen
- r. Brianna Rittschof
- s. Megan Rodriguez
- t. Wendi Savard
- u. Christine Scanlon
- v. Gracyn Shorette
- w. Jessica Wheeler

**Items 9 (b), (c), (d), (f), (i), (o), (r), (v), and (w) were removed. See agenda item V. 2.**

After discussion and consideration, a motion was made by Dr. Bertch and seconded by Ms. Creager to approve the above amended certified technicians pending receipt of issuance fee. Motion passed unanimously.

**10. Board may review, discuss, and take action on technician application.**

- a. Hollie Chiles

After discussion and consideration, a motion was made by Ms. Frost and seconded by Dr. Jaynes to approve Ms. Chiles certified technician application pursuant to § 32-2242 (B). Motion passed unanimously.

**11. Case 19-46, In Re: Michael Keller, DVM. Board may review, discuss, and take action on possible summary suspension or may offer a consent agreement for suspension or voluntary surrender of license or move matter to hearing for possible revocation of licensure.**

After discussion and consideration, the Board directed staff to place this matter on a future Board meeting agenda.

**12. Board may review, discuss, and take action on Board member attendance at American Association of Veterinary State Boards' "Board Basics & Beyond" training course.**

After discussion and consideration, Dr. Jaynes was selected to attend the American Association of Veterinary State Boards' "Board Basics & Beyond" training course.

**13. Board may review, discuss, and take action on Executive Order 2019-01.**

Ms. Whitmore updated the Board on Executive Order 2019-01 related to the continued rule-making moratorium. More information will be provided by the Governor's office which will be relayed to the Board at a future meeting.

**14. Board may review, discuss, and take action regarding required Five Year Rule Review.**

Ms. Whitmore updated the Board regarding the required Five Year Rule Review that is due later this year.

**15. Board may review, discuss and take action on information provided by Beth Lockhart regarding efforts to modify Veterinary Practice Act and associated Administrative Rules related to shelter veterinarians.**

Ms. Beth Lockhart appeared, made statements and answered questions. No action was taken.

**16. Board may review, discuss, and take action on approval of veterinary license pending receipt of license fee.**

**a. Logan Hille (R)**

After discussion and consideration, a motion was made by Dr. Bertch and seconded by Ms. Creager to approve Dr. Hille's veterinary license pending receipt of license fee. Motion passed unanimously.

**17. Executive Director Report**

**a. Posting audio recordings of Board meetings**

Ms. Whitmore reported that as of January 2019 the Board will be posting audio recordings of Board meetings on the website which is required to remain available for at least 3 years.

**b. Board member appointment update**

Ms. Whitmore reported that several Board member terms have expired and efforts are ongoing by the Governor's Office to conduct interviews.

**c. License/Certificate renewals update**

Ms. Whitmore provided statistics on license/certificate renewal applications received and usage of the online license renewal system.

**VI. REVIEW AND APPROVAL OF MINUTES**



**a. December 12, 2018 Regular Session**

After discussion and consideration, a motion was made by Dr. Bertch and seconded by Ms. Creager to approve the December 12, 2018 regular session minutes. Motion passed with 7 ayes, 1 abstention (Dr. Jaynes).

**b. December 17, 2018 Regular Session**

After discussion and consideration, a motion was made by Ms. Creager and seconded by Ms. Frost to approve the December 17, 2018 regular session minutes. Motion passed with 6 ayes, 2 abstentions (Dr. Jaynes and Dr. Bertch).

**VII. CONSENT AGENDA**

**A. Approval to take Veterinary State Exam**

1. Thiel, Kerri (E)
2. Shelly, Bert (E)
3. Cooper, Casey (R)
4. Birrenbach, Lindsay (E)
5. Herendeen, Hillary (E)
6. Muller, Elizabeth (E)

**Approval to take Veterinary State Exam granted.**

**B. Approval of Faculty Member License**

1. Turner, Hailey

**Approval of Faculty Member License granted.**

**C. Approval of Reinstatement of Veterinary License**

1. Durket, Elyse

**Approval of Reinstatement of Veterinary License granted.**

**D. Approval of Veterinary License**

1. Boyer, Nathan (E)
2. Hollis, Alexandria (R)
3. Kaplan, Megan (E)

**Approval of Veterinary Licenses granted.**

**E. Approval of Reinstatement of Technician Certification**

1. Walker, Adriana

**Approval of Reinstatement of Technician Certification granted.**

**F. Approval of State Employee License**

1. McCluney, Jareca

**Approval of State Employee License granted.**

**G. Approval of Temporary Permit(s)**

1. Birrenbach, Lindsay
2. Muller, Elizabeth

**Approval of Temporary Permits granted.**



#### **H. Approval of Technician Certification**

1. Villa, Beatriz
2. Yoder, Taylor

**Approval of Technician Certification granted.**

#### **I. Premises Change of Scope Requests**

1. R2164: Fetch A Vet. Change of Scope. Monica Brown, DVM.

**Approval of Change of Scope Request granted.**

#### **J. Approval of Premises Licenses**

1. R3184: Class Pet – Pima JTED Veterinary Clinic. New Premise. Dimitri Brown, DVM.
2. R3185: Dr. Jodie's Integrative Consulting – Petz Place. New Premises. Jodie Gruenstern, DVM.
3. R3186: Valley Vet Care. New Premises. Refaat Ishak, DVM.
4. R3187: To the Point Veterinary Services. New Premises. Keri O'Neal, DVM.
5. R3188: Prescott Area Pet Emergency Hospital. New Responsible Veterinarian. Katrina Tavaschi, DVM.
6. R3189: Gentle Journey – AS. New Premises. Amanda Simonson, DVM.
7. R3190: Banfield Pet Hospital #1269. New Responsible Veterinarian. Drew Pearson, DVM.
8. R3191: Mobile Animal Surgical Hospital. Address Change. Julia Neufeld, DVM.
9. R3192: Page Animal Hospital. New Responsible Veterinarian. Bret Miller, DVM.
10. R3193: Soul Puppy. New Premises. Colleen Brown, DVM.
11. R3194: Yavapai Humane Society Spay & Neuter Clinic. James Styre, DVM.
12. R3195: Blue Ridge Pet Clinic. New Ownership/New Responsible Veterinarian. Kelly Burke, DVM.
13. R3196: Banfield Pet Hospital #0135. New Responsible Veterinarian. Kelsey Gardner, DVM.
14. R3197: Velocity Equine Sports Medicine PLLC. New Premises. Kate Shoemaker, DVM.
15. R3198: Voliva Equine LLC. Address Change. Amy Voliva, DVM.

**J (1), (5), (6), (7), (8), (9), (10), (11), (13), (14) and (15) Removed from Consent Agenda.**

**Approval of Premise Licenses granted.**

After discussion and consideration, a motion was made by Dr. Bertch and seconded by Ms. Creager to approve the Consent Agenda as amended. Motion passed unanimously.

#### **Items Removed from Consent Agenda**

#### **J (1), (5), (6), (7), (8), (9), (10), (11), (13), (14) and (15)**

After discussion and consideration, a motion was made by Dr. Bertch and seconded by Ms. Creager to approve the above premises pending inspection and compliance. Motion passed unanimously.

#### **VIII. SUMMARY OF CURRENT EVENTS**

No summary of current events.

**IV. CALL TO PUBLIC**

No member of the public wished to speak.

**X. ESTABLISHMENT OF FUTURE MEETING DATE**

The next *regular* meeting will be held on **Wednesday, February 20, 2019**, beginning at 8:30 a.m. at 1740 W. Adams St., Board Room "A," Phoenix, Arizona, 85007.

**IX. ADJOURNMENT**

The meeting adjourned at 12:52 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,



---

Victoria Whitmore, Executive Director